

Proposal to the Board of Trustees of Macalester College to End Study Away Programs in Israel in Accordance with the Boycott, Divestment, and Sanctions Movement and in Protest of the Genocide of Palestinian People in Gaza

By [REDACTED], Quinn Roberts '25, and Gabe Karsh
'25¹
Redacted by request of the author.

June 4, 2024

¹ We would also like to acknowledge the work of Macalester students who chose not to list their full names, including Morgan and Sofia.

Section I: Introduction

We, the Mac for Palestine coalition, propose that Macalester take action in response to the genocidal action of the State of Israel by ending the promotion of two Israeli study away programs. In view of the immediate and pressing nature of the current genocidal war on Gaza, where the dictates of international law have proven ineffective, it has become increasingly clear that the only thing that will stop the genocide of Palestinians is for the United States of America to withdraw financial support and institutional legitimization to the State of Israel. Responsibility must be held by individual institutions alongside federal governments. In light of this, we consider it an urgent duty of Macalester College to academically boycott Israel by removing the Hebrew University of Jerusalem and University of Haifa from the pre-approved list for study away. We hold that such a boycott is in line with the moral requirements of the situation, Macalester's mission statement, and the wishes of its community. We hold that the popular support for this measure, and the honoring of Macalester's reputation, outweighs the risk of backlash from the minority of pro-Israel members of Macalester's community, some of whom defend Israel's genocidal war in Gaza. Likewise, we hold that the social good that is done in moving the needle one step closer to Palestinian liberation *vastly* outweighs the inconvenience to any individual student hoping to study away in Israel, who would need to go through a slightly longer process if these programs were removed from the pre-approved list.

To restate and clarify, we propose:

1. That the Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Haifa, are removed from the Center for Study Away's pre-approved list of study away programs,
2. That no Israeli universities are added to the pre-approved list until such a time as the apartheid system (as defined below) has been ended.
3. That Macalester College works to establish relationships with Palestinian Universities and provide more scholarship funding for Palestinian students.

We understand that calls for an academic boycott of Israel have often been met with confusion regarding the specificity of the demand, questioning why the same ask is not being made of programs with other countries violating international law or with serious human rights abuses.² Some argue that advocating for an academic boycott of Israel without doing the same for these other countries is a double standard or even antisemitic. Rather than any particular animus towards Israel, our boycott is targeted because (1) Palestinians suffering under Israel's policies are calling for it as part of the broader Boycott, Divestment, and Sanctions (BDS) movement, and (2) the moment of acute crisis for Palestinians, and ensuing world-wide political will which gives this boycott immediate priority over other boycotts of its type. If the U.S. had allowed programs to continue to Russia at the beginning of the invasion of Ukraine, the Macalester community should have advanced this same demand of academic boycott, assuming it reflected the will of the Ukrainian people, *not* out of a specific national hatred and racism towards Russians, but out of the specific political concerns of that moment. The call for an academic boycott of Israel is rooted in an understanding of Israel's specific geopolitical context, and the current moment which requires uniquely swift and decisive action.

² We elaborate on this topic in more detail in section VIII.

Section II: Defining Terms

To begin, we will briefly define a few terms that are used throughout this proposal.

Nakba (Ethnic Cleansing): Nakba, which means catastrophe in Arabic, is the word that Palestinians use to describe the events of 1948 in which at least 750,000 were forcibly displaced from their homes in order to create the state of Israel.³ Many Palestinians argue that the Nakba is ongoing because of Israel's continued forced displacement of Palestinians. The Nakba constitutes ethnic cleansing, which the United Nations defines as "a purposeful policy designed by one ethnic or religious group to remove by violent and terror-inspiring means the civilian population of another ethnic or religious group from certain geographic areas."⁴

Genocide: The 1948 Convention on the Prevention of Genocide defines genocide as "any of the following acts committed with intent to destroy, in whole or in part, a national, ethnical, racial or religious group, as such: (a) Killing members of the group; (b) Causing serious bodily or mental harm to members of the group; (c) Deliberately inflicting on the group conditions of life calculated to bring about its physical destruction in whole or in part; (d) Imposing measures intended to prevent births within the group; (e) Forcibly transferring children of the group to another group."⁵ The International Court of Justice ruled that Israel's actions in Gaza plausibly invoke the right of Palestinians in the territory to be protected from genocide.⁶ The UN Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in the Occupied Palestinian Territories has also found "reasonable ground" that Israel is committing a genocide in Gaza.⁷

Scholasticide: The UN defines scholasticide as "the systemic obliteration of education through the arrest, detention or killing of teachers, students and staff, and the destruction of educational infrastructure."⁸

³ Al-Haq, "73 Years of Ongoing Nakba, Palestinians Continue to be Steadfast against Israel's Settler-Colonial and Apartheid Regime," (May 15, 2021), <https://www.alhaq.org/advocacy/18334.html>.

⁴ United Nations Office of Genocide Prevention and the Responsibility to Protect, "Ethnic Cleansing," <https://www.un.org/en/genocideprevention/ethnic-cleansing.shtml>.

⁵ "Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide," (United Nations, December 9, 1948), https://www.un.org/en/genocideprevention/documents/atrocities-crimes/Doc.1_Convention%20on%20the%20Prevention%20and%20Punishment%20of%20the%20Crime%20of%20Genocide.pdf.

⁶ International Court of Justice, "Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide in the Gaza Strip (South Africa v. Israel)," (January 26, 2024), <https://www.icj-cij.org/sites/default/files/case-related/192/192-20240126-sum-01-00-en.pdf>; Dominic Casciani, "What did ICJ ruling mean in South Africa's genocide case against Israel?" (BBC News, May 17, 2024), <https://www.bbc.com/news/articles/c3g9g63jl17o>.

⁷ Francesca Albanes, "Anatomy of a Genocide," (Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, March 25, 2024), <https://www.ohchr.org/sites/default/files/documents/hrbodies/hrcouncil/sessions-regular/session55/advance-versions/a-hrc-55-73-auv.pdf>.

⁸ "UN experts deeply concerned over 'scholasticide' in Gaza," (Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, April 18, 2024), <https://www.ohchr.org/en/press-releases/2024/04/un-experts-deeply-concerned-over-scholasticide-gaza>.

Apartheid: The 1973 International Apartheid Convention defines apartheid as “inhuman acts committed for the purpose of establishing and maintaining domination by one racial group of persons over any other racial group of persons and systematically oppressing them.”⁹ The Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court defines apartheid as “...inhumane acts... committed in the context of an institutionalized regime of systematic oppression and domination by one racial group over any other racial group or groups and committed with the intention of maintaining that regime.”¹⁰ Because of Israel’s illegal 55-year occupation of the West Bank and 18-year siege of Gaza, rendering the strip an “open-air prison,” the UN Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in the Occupied Palestinian Territories has declared Israel an apartheid state.¹¹ Human Rights Watch, Amnesty International, and the Israeli human rights organization B’tselem have all declared Israel an apartheid state as well, arguing that the label applies to both the occupied territories and to Israel itself.¹²

As mentioned above, our proposal is to remove Israeli universities from Macalester’s list of pre-approved study away programs until the apartheid system comes to an end. As a group of undergraduate students, we do not pretend to be an authority on what *exactly* would constitute the end of apartheid, but we imagine that this process might include the end of the illegal occupation of Palestinian land; equal individual and national rights for Palestinians; the right of return for Palestinian refugees and resolution to the ongoing Palestinian refugee crisis, and reparations for the crimes of ethnic cleansing, apartheid, and genocide.

Section III: Evidence of Grave Social Injury

The standard of grave social injury used by the Social Responsibility Committee is usually applied only to financial investments. In its review of Macalester’s study away programs with Israeli universities, we argue that the SRC should view these programs as *institutional* investments. By offering Hebrew University and the University of Haifa on its pre-approved list of study away options, Macalester is promoting these programs to its students, in effect making an investment in the educational experience those institutions provide. Just like any other investment, if we are able to prove that the management of Hebrew University and the

⁹ “International Convention on the Suppression and Punishment of the Crime of Apartheid,” (United National, November 30, 1973),

<https://treaties.un.org/doc/publication/unts/volume%201015/volume-1015-i-14861-english.pdf>.

¹⁰ “Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court,” (International Criminal Court, July 17, 1998),

<https://www.icc-cpi.int/sites/default/files/2024-05/Rome-Statute-eng.pdf>.

¹¹ Michael Lynk, “Report of the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in the Palestinian territories occupied since 1967,” (Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, August 12, 2022),

<https://documents.un.org/doc/undoc/gen/g22/448/72/pdf/g2244872.pdf?token=LJhE7CHb1qnxSOO9Ab&f e=true>.

¹² Omar Shakir, “A Threshold Crossed: Israeli Authorities and the Crimes of Apartheid and Persecution,” (Human Rights Watch, April 2021),

https://www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/media_2021/04/israel_palestine0421_web_0.pdf; Amnesty International, “Israel’s apartheid against Palestinians: a cruel system of domination and a crime against humanity,” (February 1, 2022),

<https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2022/02/israels-apartheid-against-palestinians-a-cruel-system-of-domination-and-a-crime-against-humanity/>; B’tselem, “A regime of Jewish supremacy from the Jordan River to the Mediterranean Sea: This is apartheid,” (January 12, 2021), https://www.btselem.org/publications/fulltext/202101_this_is_apartheid.

University of Haifa cause “excessive or deliberate injurious impact,” it should constitute grave social injury.¹³ In order to prove this claim, we will examine the specific circumstances at these two universities as well as the general landscape of higher education in Israel-Palestine.

Both Hebrew University and the University of Haifa have close ties with the Israeli Defense Force (IDF). Hebrew University now hosts a specialized military intelligence training program called Havatzalot, which until 2019 was housed in the University of Haifa, where it was founded.¹⁴ Havatzalot students earn a bachelor's degree before serving six years in military intelligence units. In a letter announcing their refusal to serve in the occupied Palestinian territories, reservists from the Israeli SIGINT intelligence unit, which many Havatzalot graduates are likely to serve in, detailed unrestricted surveillance of Palestinian civilians with no discernable military objective and the use of personal information, such as undisclosed sexual orientation, to blackmail individuals into cooperation with occupation authorities.¹⁵ Other veterans of the unit recounted a regular practice of wiretapping phone calls of the mothers of military targets after airstrikes to confirm that the target had been killed, calls which were recorded and used to teach Arabic to incoming intelligence recruits.¹⁶ Legal scholars argue that the intelligence apparatus that Havatzalot graduates work in is responsible for multiple large-scale and ongoing violations of international law.¹⁷ The program also has on-campus effects. Palestinian students at Hebrew University were removed from dorms to make room for Havatzalot students and made to feel threatened by a flood of new uniformed military personnel in their classrooms and on campus after the program was moved there.¹⁸

In addition to Havatzalot, Hebrew University has for decades hosted the Talpiot Program, which trains select students in research and development for weapons systems and other security technology.¹⁹ In parallel, the University of Haifa's National Security Studies Center offers

¹³ “Macalester College Board of Trustees Guidelines for Investor Responsibility,” (December 2018), <https://www.macalester.edu/160-investment-office/wp-content/uploads/sites/231/2020/12/Guidelines-for-Investor-Responsibility-Board-Approved-December-2018.pdf>.

¹⁴ Anna Ahronheim, “Jerusalem's Hebrew University to host Military Intelligence program,” (Jerusalem Post, April 15, 2019), <https://www.jpost.com/israel-news/jerusalems-hebrew-university-to-host-military-intelligence-program-586822>.

¹⁵ Peter Beaumont, “Israeli intelligence veterans refuse to serve in Palestinian territories,” (The Guardian, September 12, 2014), <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2014/sep/12/israeli-intelligence-reservists-refuse-serve-palestinian-territories>.

¹⁶ Yuval Abraham, “‘We killed a little boy, but it was within the rules,’” (972 Magazine, August 11, 2022), <https://www.972mag.com/gaza-soldiers-civilians-intelligence/>.

¹⁷ Benjamin G. Waters, “An International Right to Privacy: Israeli Intelligence Collection In The Occupied Palestinian Territories,” (Georgetown Journal of International Law, 2019), <https://www.law.georgetown.edu/international-law-journal/wp-content/uploads/sites/21/2019/10/GT-GJIL190033.pdf>

¹⁸ Oren Ziv, “Palestinian students battle militarization of Hebrew University,” (972 Magazine, May 27, 2020), <https://www.972mag.com/palestinian-students-militarization-hebrew-university/>.

¹⁹ “Talpiot Program (520) - Bachelor's Degree,” (Hebrew University Course Catalog, 2024), <https://catalog.huji.ac.il/pages/WebChugInfoNew.aspx?year=2024&faculty=2&entityId=520°reeCode=71&language=en>; Jason Gewirtz, “Inside the IDF's Super-Secret Elite Brain Trust,” (The Tower, April 2016), <https://www.thetower.org/article/inside-the-idfs-super-secret-elite-brain-trust-talpiot/>.

courses in military strategy, including seminars from guest speakers like Yoav Gallant, now wanted by the International Criminal Court for alleged crimes against humanity in Gaza.²⁰

Hebrew University in particular has also taken advantage of Israeli territorial expansion through military force. The main campus, Mount Scopus, is surrounded by Palestinian neighborhoods in East Jerusalem but is not considered occupied territory (instead, an isolated enclave inside the Green Line). After the Six Day War in 1967, the university expanded into newly acquired territory, building in the burgeoning yet illegal French Hill settlement, where it has continued to expand onto occupied Palestinian land as recently as 2022.²¹ Hebrew University's Institute of Archaeology also operates extensively in the "City of David," an illegal settlement in the Palestinian neighborhood of Silwan in East Jerusalem. The creation of the archaeological site was facilitated by forced expulsion of Palestinians and work there has deliberately destroyed Palestinian cultural artifacts and evidence of historical non-Jewish settlement in the area.²²

Apart from their military connections, Hebrew University and the University of Haifa regularly discriminate against Arab students and repress unwanted political speech. These practices are widespread in Israeli academia and are only getting worse. Since October 7th, "36 Israeli universities and colleges have initiated disciplinary proceedings against a total of 124 Palestinian students for posts on their private social media accounts."²³ Just last week, a bill was introduced in the Knesset to require universities to fire any lecturer, teacher, or researcher who calls into question the legitimacy of the state of Israel.²⁴ What follows is a brief sample of instances of discrimination or repression at Hebrew University and the University of Haifa over the last 25 years. This list is far from comprehensive and includes only the most publicized incidents.

²⁰ The National Security Studies Center, (University of Haifa), <https://nssc.haifa.ac.il/index.php/en#>; Karim Khan, "Statement of ICC Prosecutor Karim A.A. Khan KC: Applications for arrest warrants in the situation in the State of Palestine," (International Criminal Court, May 20, 2024), <https://www.icc-cpi.int/news/statement-icc-prosecutor-karim-aa-khan-kc-applications-arrest-warrants-situation-state>.

²¹ Marshall J. Breger, "Understanding Jerusalem," (Middle East Quarterly, March, 1997), <https://www.meforum.org/343/understanding-jerusalem>; Foundation for Middle East Peace, "Settlement & Annexation Report," (January 7, 2022), <https://fmep.org/resource/settlement-annexation-report-january-7-2022/#3>; Amnesty International, "Chapter 3: Israeli Settlements and International Law," (January 30, 2019), <https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/campaigns/2019/01/chapter-3-israeli-settlements-and-international-law/>

²² Gila Hurvitz, "The City of David: Discoveries from the Excavations," (Hebrew University, The Institute of Archaeology), <https://archaeology.huji.ac.il/city-david>; Marguerite Remy and Dr Susan Power, "Finding David: Unlawful Settlement Tourism in Jerusalem's so-called 'City of David,'" (Al-Haq, 2022), https://www.alhaq.org/cached_uploads/download/2022/11/16/city-of-david-interactive-1-page-view-1668594122.pdf.

²³ Adalah, "Repression of Palestinian Students in Israeli Universities and Colleges," (May 9, 2024), <https://www.adalah.org/en/content/view/11116>.

²⁴ Shira Klein Lior B. Sternfeld, "We're Israelis who study fascism. This week, our country took a terrifying step toward the abyss," (The Forward, May 31, 2024), <https://forward.com/opinion/618223/israel-fascism-academic-dissent-law-crackdown/#:~:text=The%20National%20Union%20of%20Israeli,express%20dissent%2C%20including%20tenured%20professors>.

Hebrew University:

- In 2000, Hebrew University finalized plans to forcibly evict five Palestinian families living on land that it hoped to use for campus expansion.²⁵
- In 2006, Hebrew University refused to allow Arab members of the Alternative Information Center, a joint Israeli-Palestinian advocacy and activism group, to visit campus without a “character reference” from Israeli police.²⁶
- In 2014, Hebrew University security guards assaulted students protesting conscription of Arab Christians into the IDF.²⁷
- In 2014, Hebrew University initiated expulsion proceedings against 12 Palestinian students who participated in a gathering of students supporting Palestinian prisoners on hunger strike. At no point during the gathering were students informed that it violated any university rules.²⁸
- In 2017, Hebrew University stepped in to cancel an academic conference on Palestinian prisoners of Israel organized by a professor in its Political Science Department.²⁹
- In 2017, Hebrew University security guards dispersed Arab students with approval to pass out flyers relating to academic orientation rather than members of the far-right group, Im Tirtzu, who were harassing them.³⁰
- In 2018, Hebrew University hosted an environmental conference that featured several firms that operated exclusively or in large part on illegal settlements in the West Bank. Dissenting Israeli scholars argued that the conference made unjust and inequitable distribution of natural resources appear to be feats of environmental engineering.³¹
- In 2020, photographs from Hebrew University students alleged that Israeli snipers had been stationed on top of university buildings to shoot at protestors in the adjacent Palestinian neighborhood of Issawiya in East Jerusalem.³²

²⁵ Matthew Brubacher, “Hebrew University Seeks to Remove Forcibly Five Palestinian Families From Land It Has Seized,” (Washington Report on Middle East Affairs, July 15, 2000), <https://www.wrmea.org/2000-july/hebrew-university-seeks-to-remove-forcibly-five-palestinian-families-from-land-it-has-seized.html>.

²⁶ Adalah, “Hebrew University Conditions the Entry of Arab Activists from the Alternative Information Center on Presentation of “Character References” Based on Criminal Records,” (November 30, 2006), <https://www.adalah.org/uploads/oldfiles/newsletter/eng/nov06/3.php>.

²⁷ Haokets, “At Hebrew University, Arabic textbooks reflect a Zionist reality,” (972 Magazine, May 24, 2014), <https://www.972mag.com/at-hebrew-university-arabic-textbooks-reflect-a-zionist-reality/>. While the above incident is not the main subject of this article, it is discussed in the last section.

²⁸ Rami Younis, “Hebrew U. threatens Palestinian students with expulsion over political activities,” (972 Magazine, October 24, 2014), <https://www.972mag.com/hebrew-u-threatens-palestinian-students-with-expulsion-for-political-activities/>.

²⁹ Eli Bitan, “Hebrew U. cancels conference on Palestinian prisoners, following pressure,” (972 Magazine, May 14, 2017), <https://www.972mag.com/hebrew-u-cancels-conference-on-palestinian-prisoners-following-pressure/>.

³⁰ Adalah, “Hebrew University security guards violate Arab students’ right to free speech,” (December 27, 2017), <https://www.adalah.org/en/content/view/9332>.

³¹ Ilana Hammerman, “Hebrew University’s Disgrace and the Occupation,” (Ha’aretz, August 3, 2018), <https://www.haaretz.com/opinion/2018-08-03/ty-article-opinion/.premium/hebrew-universitys-disgrace-and-the-occupation/0000017f-e8a2-dea7-adff-f9bf6a50000>.

³² Ziv, “Palestinian students battle militarization.” Full citation with link can be found in footnote 18.

- In April of 2024, Hebrew University suspended Palestinian Professor Nadera Shalhoub-Kevorkian for describing Israel's war in Gaza as a "genocide."³³

University of Haifa:

- In 2001, the University of Haifa took disciplinary action against five students for their involvement in a demonstration against a housing shortage faced by Arab students due to discriminatory university policy giving preference to IDF veterans and racist discrimination from Israeli landlords in the area.³⁴
- In 2005, the University of Haifa hosted a conference to confront "Israel's demographic problem," a clear and racist reference to Arab citizens of Israel.³⁵
- In 2007, an Israeli District Court ruled that the University of Haifa's policy of privileging IDF veterans in student dorm selection constituted illegal discrimination against Arab students.³⁶
- In 2011, citing "the safety of students" and "general order at the university," the University of Haifa canceled a Nakba commemoration event organized by the Arab Students' Committee.³⁷
- In 2014, the University of Haifa suspended two Arab student organizations because of their participation in a Nakba commemoration event.³⁸
- In October of 2023, the University of Haifa expelled five Palestinian students over social media posts they made in the wake of October 7th, most of which did not refer directly to the attacks in Israel.³⁹ The university's rector accused the students of supporting terrorism in response to 25 faculty members who had written in defense of the students.⁴⁰

Macalester's institutional investments in Hebrew University and the University of Haifa in the form of pre-approved study away programs constitutes graves social injury because of a) their role in displacing and justifying the displacement of Palestinians; b) training of military

³³ Adalah, "Hebrew University Suspended Palestinian Professor for Labeling Israeli Actions in Gaza as Genocide," (April 9, 2024), [adalah.org/en/content/view/11083](https://www.adalah.org/en/content/view/11083).

³⁴ Adalah, "Haifa University Students Appeal Conviction by Disciplinary Committee," (November 21, 2001), <https://www.adalah.org/en/content/view/6064>.

³⁵ Moran Zelikovich, "Haifa University: Students protest against a "racist" study day," (Y-Net, May 17 2005), <https://www.ynet.co.il/articles/1.7340.L-3086590.00.html>. This article may need to be translated from Hebrew depending on what browser it is opened in. This can most easily be done using Google Chrome's built in Google Translate feature.

³⁶ Adalah, "Adalah to the Supreme Court: Haifa University is Indifferent to Discrimination against Arab Students in the Allocation of Dorms," (May 29, 2007), <https://www.adalah.org/en/content/view/6798>.

³⁷ Adalah, "Haifa University Bans Nakba Commemorative Event," (May 17, 2011), <https://www.adalah.org/en/content/view/7639>.

³⁸ Adalah, "Adalah petitions court against Haifa University's decision to prohibit activities of Arab student clubs on campus," (June 1, 2014), <https://www.adalah.org/en/content/view/8284>.

³⁹ "Israel's Haifa University expels five Palestinian students over social media posts," (The New Arab, October 10, 2023), <https://www.newarab.com/news/haifa-university-expels-palestinians-over-social-media-posts>.

⁴⁰ Mariam Farah, "Israeli academia joins the crackdown on dissent," (972, Magazine, December 3, 2023), <https://www.972mag.com/israeli-academia-crackdown-palestinian-students/>.

specialists, including in weapons and strategy development, and for its massive illegal surveillance apparatus; c) ongoing histories of discrimination against Arabs students, including violence perpetrated by university employees; and d) long-standing antidemocratic crackdowns on the free speech of students and faculty alike, including to silence critics of Israel's genocidal war in Gaza. For these reasons alone, Macalester should remove these universities from its pre-approved study away list. However, because of the scholasticide of Palestinian academia and Israeli policy of recruiting international students, we argue that this decision should not be limited to Hebrew University and the University of Haifa and that no universities in Israel be added to the pre-approved study away list until Israel's apartheid regime comes to an end.

Israel has a decades-long history of closing Palestinian universities in the West Bank and East Jerusalem as a tool of political repression, sometimes for years at a time.⁴¹ IDF raids on Palestinian university campuses have also become increasingly common. In one particularly egregious example, Al Quds University reported that "In 2013 alone, 1769 students and staff were injured by the Israeli army in 26 separate attacks on the University campus in Abu Dis."⁴² The result was hundreds of canceled classes and multiple whole-campus evacuations from 2012 to 2014.⁴³ Israeli freezes on Palestinian Authority funds have at times resulted in professors at Al Quds working without pay for months on end.⁴⁴ Calling Palestinian universities "greenhouses for growing terrorists," the Israeli government began a near total ban on students from the Gaza Strip pursuing higher education in the West Bank in 2000.⁴⁵ While there is much to be said about Israel's historical repression of higher education in the Gaza Strip as well, those points are now moot because every university in Gaza has been destroyed since October 7th.⁴⁶

Israel has also long restricted access to Palestinian universities for foreign students and academics. Visas for foreigners hoping to work at or attend universities in the West Bank are

⁴¹ Munir Fasheh, "Why Israel Closed Palestinians' University," (New York Times, December 28, 1981), <https://www.nytimes.com/1981/12/28/opinion/why-israel-closed-palestinians-university.html>; "Israel Shuts Down a University in the West Bank," (New York Times, July 9, 1982), <https://www.nytimes.com/1982/07/09/world/israel-shuts-down-a-university-in-west-bank.html>; "Israel Reopens West Bank College Closed in Uprising : Mideast: The action is seen as a test case. If all goes well, other nearby Arab campuses shuttered for the last 30 months may also reopen," (Los Angeles Times, June 17, 1990), <https://www.latimes.com/archives/la-xpm-1990-06-17-mn-325-story.html>; Molly Moore and John Ward Anderson, "Israel Closes College in Hebron," (Washington Post, January 15, 2003), <https://www.washingtonpost.com/archive/politics/2003/01/16/israelis-close-colleges-in-hebron/0a7e943e-4b05-426e-bef1-239e8d07fd2b/>; "Israel closes Palestinian university in East Jerusalem, indefinitely," (Mondoweiss, July 18, 2018), <https://mondoweiss.net/2018/07/palestinian-university-indefinitely/>.

⁴² Al-Quds University, "History," (Friend and fundraising Unit), <https://fund.alquds.edu/en/why-aqu/history.html>.

⁴³ Kamilah Moore, "Israeli attacks on Al Quds University give new meaning to 'academic freedom,'" (Mondoweiss, November 17, 2014), <https://mondoweiss.net/2014/11/israeli-university-academic/#sthash.nWmWNwkl.dpuf>.

⁴⁴ Kamala Visweswaran, "Palestinian Universities and Everyday Life under Occupation," (American Association of University Professors, September-October 2015), <https://www.aaup.org/article/palestinian-universities-and-everyday-life-under-occupation>.

⁴⁵ Gisha, "Frequently Asked Questions: Movement of Students from Gaza to the West Bank," <https://www.gisha.org/UserFiles/File/safepassage/FAQs-eng/FAQ-students.pdf>

⁴⁶ Anat Matar, "As Gaza's Lives and Homes Are Destroyed, So Is Its Higher Education," (Ha'aretz, February 8, 2024), <https://www.haaretz.com/opinion/2024-02-08/ty-article-opinion/.premium/as-gazas-lives-and-homes-are-destroyed-so-is-its-higher-education/0000018d-8906-d970-a5ed-8976424f0000>.

sparingly granted and often last only 2-3 months, not always long enough to complete even one semester.⁴⁷ For example, none of the international faculty at Birzeit University received visas allowing them to remain in the West Bank long enough to fulfill their contracts for the 2018-2019 academic year, causing at least 12 departments to lose professors.⁴⁸ An increasing practice of outright denials of visas for foreign academics has been documented by human rights organizations and Palestinian universities since at least 2016.⁴⁹ In 2022, international pressure succeeded in dissuading Israel from implementing announced restrictions allowing only 150 foreign academics and 100 foreign students in total to work at or attend universities in the West Bank each year.⁵⁰ The proposed restrictions were part of an expansion of Israel's regulation of foreigners making extended stays in the West Bank, which Human Rights Watch reported has since been used to limit the entry of foreign academics even without explicit quotas.⁵¹

Against this backdrop, Israel has announced its intentions to recruit more international students from wealthy and powerful countries—spending hundreds of millions of dollars towards this goal—which we argue is an effort to ensure that the next generation of college-educated world leaders has relationships with Israeli institutions but not with Palestinian ones.⁵² *The Israeli government promotes exchange with Israeli universities while shutting down access to Palestinian higher education.* In other words, it is state policy to ensure that foreigners study and work in schools where there are no commemorations of the Nakba, students do not organize protests or make social media posts that are too far outside of the mainstream, professors are free to talk about “Israel’s demographic problem” but not Palestinian prisoners, and nobody uses the word “genocide.” This strategy is consistent with other Israeli programs, like Taglit (birthright) which is aimed at shoring up support for Israel among American Jews through free trips to the country that offer a one-sided perspective.⁵³

The policy of recruiting international students to Israeli universities is especially effective because of Israeli academia’s role in disseminating propaganda. The assumption that higher education in Israel is “progressive” and “at the forefront of defending Palestinian rights” is false.

⁴⁷ Visweswaran, “Palestinian Universities and Everyday Life.”

⁴⁸ Adalah, “Israel forcing international lecturers out of West Bank Palestinian universities,” (April 20, 2021), <https://www.adalah.org/en/content/view/9767>.

⁴⁹ Adalah, “Israel forcing international lecturers out.”

⁵⁰ “New rules for foreigners’ entry into West Bank take effect,” (Times of Israel, October 21, 2022), <https://www.timesofisrael.com/new-rules-for-foreigners-entry-into-west-bank-take-effect/>.

⁵¹ Human Rights Watch, “West Bank: New Entry Rules Further Isolate Palestinians,” (January 23, 2023), <https://www.hrw.org/news/2023/01/23/west-bank-new-entry-rules-further-isolate-palestinians>; Coordination of Government Activities in the Territories Operations Department, “Procedure for Entry and Residence of Foreigners in the Judea and Samaria Area,” (December 21, 2022), [https://www.gov.il/BlobFolder/policy/judeaentry2022/en/%D7%A0%D7%95%D7%94%D7%9C%D7%9B%D7%A0%D7%99%D7%A1%D7%AA%20%D7%96%D7%A8%D7%99%D7%9D%20%D7%91%D7%90%D7%A0%D7%92%D7%9C%D7%99%D7%AA-%20%D7%AA%D7%A8%D7%92%D7%95%D7%9D%20%D7%9E%D7%A2%D7%95%D7%93%D7%9B%D7%9F%20%D7%93%D7%A6%D7%9E%D7%91%D7%A8%202022%20\(2\).pdf](https://www.gov.il/BlobFolder/policy/judeaentry2022/en/%D7%A0%D7%95%D7%94%D7%9C%D7%9B%D7%A0%D7%99%D7%A1%D7%AA%20%D7%96%D7%A8%D7%99%D7%9D%20%D7%91%D7%90%D7%A0%D7%92%D7%9C%D7%99%D7%AA-%20%D7%AA%D7%A8%D7%92%D7%95%D7%9D%20%D7%9E%D7%A2%D7%95%D7%93%D7%9B%D7%9F%20%D7%93%D7%A6%D7%9E%D7%91%D7%A8%202022%20(2).pdf).

⁵² Lior Dattel, “Israel to Spend \$118 Million to Bring in Foreign University Students,” (Ha’aretz, October 22, 2018), <https://www.haaretz.com/israel-news/business/2018-10-11/ty-article/israel-to-spend-118-million-to-bring-in-foreign-university-students/0000017f-e605-da9b-a1ff-ee6f8ff90000>, https://che.org.il/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/FJI_004.pdf

⁵³ Jewish Currents, “Roundtable: The Ethical Response to Birthright,” (November 21, 2019), <https://jewishcurrents.org/roundtable-the-ethical-response-to-birthright>.

Israeli universities participate in a systematic effort to erase Palestinian history and perspectives, acting as arms of a state-wide propaganda strategy to legitimate violence and apartheid. Since their founding, these universities have often served as outposts for colonial expansion and military development, carrying with them the ideological foundations from which those projects arise. Israeli Universities compliment the suppression and destruction of sites of Palestinian education by providing the resources, both intellectually and materially, to defend Israel from accountability and international criticism.⁵⁴ Some courses offered at these institutions also directly produce state propaganda towards those ends.⁵⁵ It is not only dishonest but dangerous to list these universities as pre-approved study away programs when they subject Macalester students to narratives that actively discourage dialogue and limit academic freedoms.

Israeli propaganda is produced and disseminated at higher educational facilities through tactics such as greenwashing and pinkwashing.⁵⁶ In part through academic conferences like the example given at Hebrew University, Israel claims to have made the barren desert bloom, implicitly dehumanizing indigenous communities who farmed that land for generations before 1948.⁵⁷ This is greenwashing propaganda that simply exists to try and show why the Zionist settlers are more deserving of the land than Palestinians, who supposedly neglected it. Pinkwashing is a propaganda strategy that Israel utilizes by exploiting the LGBTQ+ community to deflect attention away from their oppressive policy and present a falsely 'progressive' image of themselves aboard. But, while Israel attempts to use queer people to justify their project of ethnic-cleansing, queer organizations push back by pointing out the obvious reality: the biggest threat to queer people right now is Israel's genocide as the IDF kills queer and non-queer Palestinians alike.⁵⁸ These are just two examples of Israel's normalization campaign and to do this they erase the history of Palestinians and Jewish people who were living in Palestine far before Israel was created. Instead of promoting education and access to information, these tactics deliberately promote false narratives and conceal Israeli human rights violations. What boycotting does is reject this normalization and erasure.

Section IV: Academic Boycott and Academic Freedom

Macalester's decision to end its study away relationship with Israeli universities would be a proactive refusal to participate in the propaganda strategy of an apartheid state. Although Macalester is small, these kinds of boycotts are effective and our participation matters. Former Israeli President Ezer Weizman called academic boycotts a "strategic threat of the first order," signaling that Israel is sensitive to pressure from academic institutions.⁵⁹ The Israeli government

⁵⁴ Maya Wind, "Israel's Universities Are a Key Part of Its Apartheid Regime," (Jacobin, February 27, 2024), <https://jacobin.com/2024/02/israel-universities-palestine-apartheid-academia>.

⁵⁵ Wind, "Israel's Universities."

⁵⁶ Maya Wind, "The Complicity of Israeli Academia." By Raphael Magarik, (Jewish Currents, May 23, 2024), <https://jewishcurrents.org/the-complicity-of-israeli-academia>.

⁵⁷ Manal Shqair, "No, Israel Is Not Making the Desert Bloom," (Jacobin, October 21, 2023), <https://jacobin.com/2023/10/israel-settler-colonialism-greenwashing-eco-normalization-water-energy>.

⁵⁸ al-Qaws, "Beyond Propaganda: Pinkwashing as Colonial Violence," (October 18, 2020), http://www.alqaws.org/articles/Beyond-Propaganda-Pinkwashing-as-Colonial-Violence?category_id=0.

⁵⁹ Jonathan Lis and Yarden Skop, "Rivlin: Academic Boycotts Against Israel Are First-rate Strategic Threat," (Ha'aretz, May 28, 2015),

puts its money where Rivlin's mouth is, spending tens of millions of dollars to fight the BDS movement, especially in the US.⁶⁰ Academic boycott is also part of what brought down apartheid in South Africa.⁶¹ We urge the SRC to recommend this proposal not just because it is the right thing to do but because it has the potential to make real change.

The most common objection to academic boycott is that it violates the principles of academic freedom. We subscribe to the internationally-accepted definition of academic freedom adopted by the United Nations Committee on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights and do not believe that our proposal infringes on any individual's academic freedom.⁶² Israeli academics may lose privileges but not rights due to the boycott of their institutions.

Any conversation about academic freedom in the context of Israel-Palestine must begin from the reality of the scholasticide of Palestinian academia. We must consider the scholars killed and universities destroyed in the last 7 months by the IDF, and the countless educational opportunities stifled in the last few decades by Israel's apartheid regime. We must talk about all of the Palestinian children who will never grow up to have the opportunity to participate in the kind of "free exchange of ideas" we all wish was possible because they have been bombed, incinerated, shot, and starved to death. We ask that each member of this SRC take on the responsibility of centering the group's discussions not on abstract ideals and hypothetical circumstances, but on the material reality of Palestinians in Gaza, whose median age is lower than that of our own student body.⁶³

We refuse to allow the coded call for "open dialogue" to excuse Macalester's institutional responsibility as a global citizen to act in response to genocidal violence anywhere in the world. You might ask, 'What could possibly be wrong with dialogue?' However, more fitting questions might be: 'Can such open dialogue even be achieved under the current censorship and scholasticide?' and, 'Is it ethical to collaborate with a militarized, racist, colonial state to whitewash its crimes?' In the case of South Africa, academics recognized the only effective approach was to oppose apartheid through boycotts, divestment, and sanctions, denying South African institutions any support or dialogue, and adhering to the advice of the African National Congress (ANC). Macalester must recognize that collaboration with Israeli academia perpetuates the occupation and oppression of Palestinians and that the promotion of these

<https://www.haaretz.com/2015-05-28/ty-article/.premium/rivlin-academic-boycotts-first-rate-strategic-threat/0000017f-ead0-d4cd-af7f-ebf83a6d0000>.

⁶⁰ Refaella Goichman, "This anti-BDS Initiative Failed. So Israel Throws Another \$30 Million at It," (Ha'aretz, January, 26, 2022),

<https://www.haaretz.com/israel-news/2022-01-26/ty-article-magazine/.premium/this-anti-bds-initiative-failed-so-israel-throws-another-100-million-nis-at-it/0000017f-db50-df9c-a17f-ff58b4110000>.

⁶¹ "South Africa's Academic and Cultural Boycott," (South Africa History Online), <https://sahistory.org.za/article/south-africas-academic-and-cultural-boycott>.

⁶² "Implementation of the International Covenant on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights," (United Nations, 1999),

<https://docstore.ohchr.org/SelfServices/FilesHandler.ashx?enc=4slQ6QSmIBEDzFEovLCuW%2bKyH%2bnXprasyMzd2e8mx4cYID1VMUKXaG3Jw9bomillKS84HB8c9nIHQ9mUemvt0Fbz%2f0SS7kENyDv5%2fbYPWAXMw47K5jTga59puHtt3NZr>.

⁶³ Christopher Wolf and Julia Haines, "Life and Death Before the War: Israel, Gaza and the West Bank by the Numbers," (US News & World Report, November 14, 2023),

<https://www.usnews.com/news/best-countries/articles/2023-11-14/population-religion-and-poverty-the-demographics-of-israel-and-gaza#:~:text=About%2040%25%20of%20Gaza's%20population,from%20the%20CIA's%20World%20Factbook>.

programs amounts to a further investment in the ongoing genocide. By boycotting Israeli universities, we stand in solidarity with Palestinian scholars and students who are denied their basic rights and freedoms.

Section V: Alignment with Mission

As stated in its mission, Macalester is committed to providing an educational program with a “special emphasis on internationalism, multiculturalism, and service to society.”⁶⁴ These values are inconsistent with the legitimization and support of an apartheid state actively engaged in a violent campaign of ethnic cleansing. Israeli universities, including the University of Haifa and Hebrew University, are used to both materially and ideologically support the oppression and dispossession of Palestinians. Keeping these universities on the pre-approved list for study abroad promotes the sending of Macalester students to educational environments that *actively suppress internationalism and multiculturalism*. When looking to study away, students rely on and trust the college’s discernment in curating the pre-approved list. The tacit support of institutions that work against the college’s values undermines Macalester’s mission and de-prioritizes our emphasis on internationalism, multiculturalism, and service to society.

In Macalester’s Statement of Purpose and Belief, Macalester emphasizes the importance of students taking responsibility for their “personal, social, and intellectual choices”, as well as students being willing to be held accountable for their beliefs.⁶⁵ In this proposal, Mac for Palestine is asking for Macalester to be held to the same standards it claims to value. Macalester has the opportunity to stand behind its values by engaging in an academic boycott of Israeli universities and thus withdrawing its support for a pattern of violence and a system of apartheid.

Section VI: Support from Community

As with divestment, Academic boycott should be pursued only if there is demonstrated, sustained support from the Macalester community. The Macalester community has demonstrated this support for Palestine and for boycotting Israeli universities in numerous ways over the past year, and in many years prior. The following list is a revised version of the one presented along with the Divestment proposal to point out where events *specifically* called for Academic Boycott.

On November 2nd, 2023 Mac for Palestine launched our petition to end Study Abroad to Israeli universities, and just a few days later on November 5th we received over 750 signatures from students, student organizations, alumni, faculty/staff, and parents. Shortly thereafter our petition reached over 1000 signatures.

On November 9th we held a walk-out for Palestine, and in support of academically boycotting Israel, that over 600 community members attended, including entire departments canceling class to support their students in attending and attending themselves.

⁶⁴ Macalester College, “Mission and History,” <https://www.macalester.edu/about/mission>.

⁶⁵ Macalester, “Mission and History.”

November 14th we partnered with other student organizations from St. Kates, UMN, and Augsburg University as well as local Twin Cities organizations for a rally on Macalester campus and a march around the neighborhood. Over 1000 community members showed up to march with us for this protest.

From December 5-7th we held a bake sale in the upper flood of the CC that raised \$3,241.92 that we donated to the United Nations Relief and Workers Agency.

December 7th, 8th, and 10th we held a Palestinian film festival.

December 13th we held a disruptive action during the finals midnight breakfast tradition that over 50 students participated in during which we made specific calls to end Macalester's study away programs in Israel.

February 26th we held another rally and march partnering with student organizations from St. Kates and UMN as well as a local twin cities organization that over 250 community members attended.

March 1st we disrupted the Mac tradition of pushball with a banner drop that accompanied a pamphlet we made outlining the last 50 years of Macalester unethical financial decisions.

The morning of March 6th over 50 macalester community members entered Markim hall and occupied the second floor where the Center for Study Away is located to participate with us in a 'die-in' protest calling for Academic boycott. We occupied the second floor for 48 hours and during that time over 120 community members, including staff and faculty joined us. Additionally, without Mac for Palestine asking for any donations, community members took it upon themselves to reach out and donate over \$600 to us to help provide supplies we needed for our die-in as well as bring us food/supplies.

We held a protest outside of Markim on March 7th during the die-in that over 100 community members attended.

On April 30th we held an art-build event with roughly 30 students in attendance.

In addition to all of the events Mac for Palestine organized, we led students to and spoke at weekly rallies the local organization Women Against Military Madness holds at the corner of Snelling and Summit Ave every Friday afternoon from 4-5pm.

Other events in the Macalester community similarly demonstrate broad consensus for action in defense of Palestinians in Gaza. One of these events was designed to honor the loss of both Israeli and Palestinian lives, some were meant to simply foster respectful and thoughtful dialogue, but most took a clear stance against the Israeli offensive in Gaza even if they did not use the word "genocide" or discuss issues like Zionism or apartheid. No events have been held on campus in the past academic year in support of Israel or its actions.

On October 12th, the Macalester Jewish Organization invited the campus community to a "Jewish Mourning Ritual" for all of those who had died since October 7th. The event was led by a future Mac for Palestine member.

Also on October 12th, IfNotNow held an event entitled "Making Sense of This Moment" featuring a presentation from Jewish and Palestinian students and a screening of the movie, "The Present," about a Palestinian family trying to travel between the West Bank and Israel. The

event had at least 65 attendants and condemned both the October 7th attacks and Israel's actions, some of which already constituted war crimes.

From October 23-26th, Friends of Doctors Without Borders held a bake sale for Doctors Without Borders to support their emergency aid for Palestinians in Gaza.

On October 24th, IfNotNow held an event entitled "A Step Closer to Peace" that detailed the latest state of affairs on the ground in Gaza. With at least 40 attendees, presenters at the event spoke explicitly about BDS as an important strategy for a just and lasting peace.

Also on October 24th, Professor Wendy Weber held an information session about Israel/Palestine.

On November 7th, Adelante! held a "Vigil for Palestine" with at least 150 participants.

On November 9th, the Macalester College Student Government passed a resolution calling on the administration to end Macalester's study away programs in Israel.

On November 13th, the Macalester chapter of the Young Democratic Socialists of America held an event entitled "Against Apartheid."

On November 15th, Professor Wendy Weber held an event entitled "It's Feminist to Demand a Ceasefire in Israel-Palestine."

On November 16th, a group of students involved with the "When Home is Hard" series, supported by the Lealtad-Suzuki Center, hosted an event entitled "When A Genocide is Happening Right In Front of Our Eyes" with at least 20 participants.

On November 17th and December 11-12th, the Institute for Global Citizenship held "Turning Towards Each Other" events to foster dialogue.

On February 1st, Professor Wendy Weber held another information session.

On February 10th, the Center for Religious and Spiritual Life held a screening of *Children of Peace*, a movie about a village where Israelis and Palestinians intentionally live together. The screening was followed by a conversation with the film maker.

On February 13th, the Institute for Global Citizenship held an event entitled "The Contrapuntal Imagination: Alternative Palestinian and Jewish Narratives About the Present and Past."

On February 21st, the Lealtad-Suzuki Center hosted Dr. Christine Harb for a presentation entitled "Unveiling Palestine: A Historical Exploration of Oppression and Resistance."

On March 25th, the Latinx Student Union held a bake sale fundraiser for the United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East.

This non-exhaustive list demonstrates the Macalester student, alumni, and surrounding communities' support for an academic boycott of Israeli institutions, and for Palestinian liberation more broadly.

Section VII: Expanding on Connections with Palestinian Universities

In addition to the boycott of Israeli institutions and study away programs for their complicity and contributions to the violence, displacement, destruction, and more against Palestinians and other groups, to align with Macalester's mission of internationalism,

multiculturalism, and service to society, and with the demands from groups such as Boycott, Divestment, Sanctions (BDS), Palestinian Campaign for the Academic and Cultural Boycott of Israel (PACBI), the US Center for Palestinian Rights, and more, it is important for Macalester to establish academic relations with Palestinian universities, including through study away programs and establishing research/academic relations as possible. Once connections and financial support with corporations and institutions which are part of the discrimination and suppression Palestinians face have been cut, as many institutions across the United States and other countries have already done due to the same concerns, Macalester College should seek relations with Palestinian academic institutions which build direct solidarity with them.

We understand and share in the desire for deep engagement with the complicated realities of life in Israel and Palestine, but we do not believe that maintaining relationships with institutions that uphold apartheid are necessary for that to happen. We offer three possible alternatives to study away program in Israel:

1. We believe that the scholasticide of Palestinian academia necessitates a response from universities around the world to provide alternative opportunities to Palestinian students. We propose that Macalester create new and increased scholarship opportunities for Palestinian students. We'd like to suggest that Macalester creates a program for at least 5 Palestinian students who have been displaced because of the ongoing genocide to every year to have a full-ride scholarship so they may finish their studies at Macalester.
2. We propose that Macalester work with experts both inside and outside of the college to develop opportunities to learn (whether through whole courses or otherwise) about the histories, cultures, and struggles of those who have lived between the Jordan river and the Mediterranean Sea.
3. We propose that Macalester work to establish relationships with Palestinian universities, either for study away programs if possible or other forms of learning and exchange.

Section VIII: Why Israel

The question may remain why we are focusing our proposal specifically on these two programs when Macalster has other pre-approved programs in countries violating international human rights law as well. Here are three reasons:

First, the geopolitical context matters. Boycotts are a means to an end. They are a strategy that can be an effective pressure on foreign governments, but this is contextually specific. In the case of Israel, academic boycotts have the potential to exert significant pressure because of the state's reliance on international legitimacy and support. Israel actively seeks to present itself as a progressive and democratic society, and the loss of academic collaboration can undermine this narrative. Additionally, academic boycotts have the potential to exert significant pressure because they are already a well known tactic advocated by Palestinians in the BDS movement. In fact, Pitzer College removed the University of Haifa from its pre-approved list of study away programs earlier this year after a long student organizing effort.⁶⁶ Macalester ending study away with these universities draws global attention to Israel's

⁶⁶ Sara Weissman, "Pitzer Drops Study Abroad in Israel. Will Others Follow?" (Inside Higher Ed, April 8, 2024),

policies of occupation and apartheid, and their violations of human rights and international law while amplifying the call for justice. While we do not necessarily oppose the removal of programs in other contexts, Israel is a unique case because there are no other coordinated international movements using academic boycott as a strategy to effect political change.

Secondly, the current political moment matters. We believe the ongoing genocide in Gaza demands immediate and decisive action. These atrocities are a stark reminder of the urgent need for institutions like Macalester to stand firmly on the side of justice and human rights. We must not wait until the genocide is over, until all Israeli universities can do is begin events with a land declaration or until it is no longer controversial to say you care about Palestinian lives and stand for Palestinian liberation. All this is to say that this crisis is not just a distant tragedy; it is a call to action, to stand by our moral and ethical principles. As an institution committed to global citizenship, Macalester has a responsibility to respond to current events with more than just words. Members of the SRC have the power to take one small step to respond to the current crisis in Gaza.

Finally, this issue matters to the Macalester community right now. As demonstrated in section VI, the proposal to remove these two programs from the pre-approved study away list has broad support from students, faculty, staff, and alumni. This proposal is the culmination of a two year campaign and months of intensive organizing since October 7th. If another coalition received such strong and active support from the campus community for the removal of a different study away program, or for any specific advocacy, we hope that Macalester would take similar steps to seriously review their proposals and pass them along to the Board of Trustees.